## EU Company Law

Common business law of 28 states

2nd edition



DJØF Publishing

## EU Company Law



## Common business law of 28 states

EU Company Law provides an account of a wide range of subjects of extreme importance to European businesses.

Among the subjects treated are: The company's right to operate in other countries on an equal footing with domestic enterprises. Federal company organisational forms: The economic interesting grouping and the SE company. Tax-free structural changes across borders. Formation and capital injection. Dividend and other capital outflows. General meetings, board of directors and management, including the issue of single-tier or two-tier company management. Subscription and representation rules. Liability in damages. Group relationships, including across borders. Employees and their position in regard to outsourcing. The annual report. Merger between companies of the same or different nationalities. Merger control. Division and business transfer. Voluntary and compulsory dissolution. Reconstruction.

The topics are treated in the book on a common European basis. It will make history when, in future, the company law of 28 European states will be modelled on the same basic rules: 15 old EU states, three EEA states, and up to 10 new EU states.

The author, professor *Erik Werlauff*, LLD, (born in 1952), was trained at the Department of Justice and as a practising lawyer with licence to appear before the Danish Supreme Court. He undertakes research and lectures in commercial law at the Aalborg University and has published a wide range of articles and books on company law, EU law, stock exchange and capital market law, financing law, and procedural law.



## Erik Werlauff

# EU-Company Law Common business law of 28 states 2nd edition

Translated by Hanne Grøn



DJØF Publishing 2003

#### EU-Company Law 2nd edition

#### © 2003 by DJØF Publishing Copenhagen

DJØF Publishing is a company of the Association of Danish Lawyers and Economists

All rights reserved.

No parts of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form og by any means – electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise – without the prior written permission of the publisher.

Cover Design: Morten Højmark Print: Narayana Press, Gylling

> Printed in Denmark 2003 ISBN 87-574-0332-5 E-bog 978-87-574-9051-0

Published and translated with support from Konsul George Jorck and Hustru Emma Jorck Aalborg University – Departement of Business Studies

> DJØF Publishing 17, Lyngbyvej P.O.Box 2702 DK-2100 Copenhagen Denmark

Phone: +45 39 13 55 00 Fax: +45 39 13 55 55 E-mail: fl@djoef.dk Homepage: www.djoef-forlag.dk

## Content

Introductions				
Abb	reviatio	ns	XVII	
		egal Personality And Cross-border Mobility		
of C	-	es	1	
1.1.		nining the concept of legal person	1	
1.2.		munity law definition of legal personality	2	
1.3.		any nationality determination and -change;		
		ational choice of law	3	
1.4.	•	any law consequences of the EU requirement of		
	_	treatment irrespective of nationality	19	
	1.4.1.	Companies	19	
	1.4.2.	Shareholders and other company participants	31	
	1.4.3.	Board and management members	32	
	1.4.4.	Capital movements, e.g. in-group	35	
	1.4.5.	Summary: The EU law objective of company law		
		organisational freedom of choice v the states'		
		pursuit of control, security against evasion etc	35	
1.5.	Liabili	ty and lifting the veil of incorporation	39	
1.6.	Loyalt	y duty towards the interests of the legal person	44	
Chaj	pter 2. T	he Legal Development	57	
2.1.	Treaty	law basis	57	
2.2.	Second	dary legislation as an instrument of legal		
	develo	pment	61	
2.3.	Overv	riew of provisions and proposals	71	
2.4.	Main f	eatures of the substance of the rules and drafts	75	
	2.4.1.	The Disclosure Directive	75	

	2.4.2.	The Capital Directive	77
	2.4.3.	The Merger Directive	83
	2.4.4.	The Annual Accounts Directive	83
	2.4.5.	The Draft Structural Directive	85
	2.4.6.	The Directive on Division of companies	87
	2.4.7.	The Directive on consolidated accounts	87
	2.4.8.	The Auditor Directive	88
	2.4.9.	The Draft Group Directive	89
	2.4.10.	The Draft Directive on International Merger	90
	2.4.11.	The Branch Directive	90
	2.4.12.	The Single-Member Company Directive	91
	2.4.13.	The Draft Take-Over Directive	93
	2.4.14.	Draft Directive on international transfer	
		of registered office	94
	2.4.15.	The Draft Liquidation Directive	95
	2.4.16.	The Regulation on Economic Interest Groupings .	95
	2.4.17.	The Merger Control Regulation	96
	2.4.18.	Regulation on the European Limited Liability	
		Company: The SE Company	99
	2.4.19.	Draft Regulation on the European Private	
		Company	100
	2.4.20.	Draft Regulation on the European Co-operative	
		Society	100
2.5.	Perspe	ctives	100
	•		
Char	oter 3. Ca	ompany types	105
3.1.		stinction between personal and capital companies	105
3.2.		oprietorships/sole trader enterprises	106
3.3.	•	member companies	109
3.4.	_	rships, including economic interest groupings	115
3.5.		ropean Company, SE	135
	3.5.1.	The need for a common European company	135
	3.5.2.	Aims still to be achieved	136
	3.5.3.	What could more be achieved as per 8 October 2009	137
	3.5.4.	The hierarchy of the sources of law	139
	3.5.5.	Legal personality, liability limitation and capital	
		requirements	140

	3.5.6.	The SE's equal position with ordinary public			
		limited liability companies	141		
	3.5.7.	Registration, disclosure, commencement of			
		business and promoters' liability	141		
	3.5.8.	The four methods of formation	142		
	3.5.9.	The SE company organs	146		
	3.5.10.	Registered office and transfer	149		
	3.5.11.	Employees	154		
3.6.	The Eu	ropean Co-operative Society	158		
3.7.		ropean private company	160		
_	=	ompany Taxation, Capital Injection Levy, and Stock rnover Levy	161		
4.1.	_	portance of the equal treatment requirement in	101		
2.2.		ny taxation	161		
4.2.	•	gal basis for EU law provisions on company tax	172		
4.3.		ing a group: Tax free merger and takeover	175		
4.4.		a group: The group as a tax unit	177		
4.5.	_	l injection duties and bans against other charges	1//		
<b>1.</b> 9.		ital injection	179		
	on cap.	ttal injection	179		
Chaj	pter 5. Co	ompany and Enterprise: From Entity Law to			
Ente	rprise La	aw	189		
5.1. I	Enterpris	e law and Company law	189		
5.2.	The Tr	eaty and the enterprises	191		
5.3.	Second	lary Community law and the enterprises	192		
5.4.	From p	personally owned to company owned enterprise	193		
5.5.	The en	terprise in a company framework	195		
	5.5.1.	The internal relations of the enterprise	196		
	5.5.2.	The external relations of the enterprise	197		
	5.5.3.	A group in a Community law sense	198		
	5.5.4.	From entity law to enterprise law	199		
5.6.	Summa	arising characteristics of the concept of enterprise			
	in Com	in Community law			

Chaj	pter 6. Formation of companies	201
6.1.	Formation procedure and instruments	201
6.2.	Non-cash contributions	204
6.3.	The lack of legal capacity of the company	206
6.4.	Payments and ban against discounts	207
6.5.	Registration and publication of the formation	209
6.6.	Establishment of branches in other EU and EEA states	215
Chaj	pter 7. Injection of capital to the company	225
7.1.	General on loan capital	225
7.2.	Loans with a conversion or subscription right	227
7.3.	Authorised capital	229
7.4.	Power to decide capital increase	230
7.5.	Capital increase upon general meeting resolution	232
7.6.	Non-cash contributions	235
7.7.	The pre-emption right of the shareholders	239
7.8.	Duty of payment-up and time limit for subscribed	
	company capital	246
7.9.	Intermediate forms of loan capital and equity:	
	subordinated loan capital	248
Chaj	pter 8. Capital outflow	251
8.1.	The power to decide dividend payments	251
8.2.	Amount at the disposal for dividend	252
8.3.	Is account dividend payment allowed?	254
8.4.	Publication of proposed dividend in respect of the	
	accounting year passed	257
8.5.	Non-distributable reserves	258
8.6.	Repayment of unlawful payments	259
8.7.	The company's subscription for, purchase of, loantaking	
	on or financing of its own shares	260
8.8.	Loan, security or guarantee to the benefit of company	
	shareholders or members of management or	
	supervisory body	276
8.9.	Disguised dividend	280

8.10.	Capital reduction (with payment to the shareholders),	
	amortisation, redemption or re-purchase of shares	284
8.11.	Companies operating at a loss – the company's duty to react,	
	capital reduction without payment to the shareholders	292
-	oter 9. Securities issued by the company	299
9.1.	Legal basis and security concept	299
9.2.	Share certificates	299
9.3.	Securities without nominal value	301
9.4.	Securities carrying special rights	304
9.5.	Stock exchange listing of shares	306
9.6.	Public offers of securities without stock exchange listing	313
9.7.	Stock exchange law requirements governing securities	315
-	oter 10. The internal regulation of the company	319
10.1.	Articles of association and memorandum of association	319
10.2.	Rules of procedure or instructions for bodies of	
	management or supervision	328
10.3.	Employment contracts	330
10.4.	Shareholder agreements	332
C1		225
-	oter 11. The powers of the company bodies	335
11.1.	· ·	335
11.2.	General meeting powers in relation to the rest of the company bodies	337
11 2		
11.3.	Meetings of debenture owners	344
11.4.	The influence of the general meeting and others on the	2.45
11 -	composition of the bodies of management and supervision	347
11.5.	The mutual delimitation of competence of the bodies	0.40
	of management and supervision	349
	11.5.1. Applicable law	349
	11.5.2. Proposed law (the Structural Directive)	350

Chap	ter 12. The general meeting
12.1.	Competence
12.2.	Ordinary/extraordinary
12.3.	Convening
12.4.	Right to attend, proxies
12.5.	The shareholders' decision basis
12.6.	The binding character of the agenda, list of participants 364
12.7.	Voting right
	12.7.1. Ordinary rules
	12.7.2. Share classes of differing voting rights
	12.7.3. Voting limitations (voting ceilings)
12.8.	Incapacity
12.9.	Majority rules
12.10.	Minutes
12.11.	Invalidation of decisions
12.12.	General meeting in cyberspace?
_	ter 13. Board and management internally:  on, decisions etc.  Election and removal 387  Executive management and supervision 391  Information and disclosure of documents 394  Remuneration, side-jobs 395  Decisions of particular scope 397  Incapacity 398  Equality between the members of the individual boards 402
13.8.	Duty of loyalty and secrecy
13.9.	Majority, quorum, absence
13.10.	Outsourcing of management functions: management
	contracts
<b>C1</b>	
_	ter 14. Board and management externally:
Repre	esentation, liability etc
<b>Repre</b> 14.1.	resentation, liability etc. 411 The power to bind the company 411
Repre	esentation, liability etc

Chap	oter 15. Company and shareholder: Takeover, groups etc	437			
15.1.	List of shareholders (register of shareholders)	437			
15.2.	Public access to know the identity of major shareholders				
	in the company				
15.3.	The company's duty to treat the shareholders equally	443			
15.4.	Majority take-over via a bid to the company's				
	shareholders	444			
15.5.	Group relationships and issues	450			
	15.5.1. Introduction	450			
	15.5.2. Judge-made group law	452			
	15.5.3. A Community law group definition	456			
	15.5.4. Directive-made group law	460			
	15.5.5. A wider perspective	463			
Chap	oter 16. Company and employee	465			
16.1.	European Works Councils	465			
16.2.	Company and Group representation:				
	Actual co-decision power	468			
16.3.	Employee shares, etc.	<b>47</b> 3			
16.4.	Business transfer, outsourcing and tender invitations	475			
16.5.	Company insolvency: Securing employee pay	486			
Char	oter 17. The company and the authorities	493			
-	National authorities	493			
	Community law authorities	499			
17.2.		1,,,			
Chap	oter 18. Accounts and Audit	507			
18.1.	Annual Accounts	507			
	18.1.1. General	507			
	18.1.2. Balance sheet	516			
	18.1.3. Profit and loss account	528			
	18.1.4. Notes	531			
	18.1.5. Annual report	534			
	18.1.10. Publication	535			
18.2.	Six-Months reports in listed companies	537			

18.3.	Consoli	idated accounts	541
	18.3.1.	The group concept	542
	18.3.2.	Exclusion of individual undertakings	548
	18.3.3.	Contents of consolidated accounts	550
18.4.	Audit,	auditors and audit committees	554
18.5.	Annual	accounts and tax accounts: Tax governed annual	
	accoun	ts (Massgeblichkeit)	560
18.6.	The fut	ure European accounts: value-based accounts	560
18.7.	Enviror	nmental issues and environmental accounts	562
18.8.	Social a	ccounts	564
Chap	oter 19. N	Ierger and Division	565
19.1.		erger Concept	565
19.2.	Merger	between companies in the same state	566
19.3.	Merger	between companies in different states	580
19.4.		n	586
19.5.	Commi	unity law merger control	593
	19.5.1.	The background of the merger control rules	593
	19.5.2.	Result: A regulation on merger control	595
	19.5.3.	Four basic principles	597
	19.5.4.	Amounts (threshold values)	597
	19.5.5.	The wide-reaching group concept of the regulation	598
	19.5.6.	Undertakings of registered (group) offices outside	
		the EU also comprised	599
	19.5.7.	The wide-reaching "merger" concept of the	
		Regulation	600
	19.5.8.	Establishment of collective dominance (oligopoly)	
		is also comprised	601
	19.5.9.	Establishment of common holding company also	
		comprised	602
	19.5.10.	Reference from and to the Commission	
		(German clause, Dutch clause)	602
	19.5.11.	Notification to the Commission	604
		Is the merger compatible with the common market?	604
		The merger is not to be carried out pending the	
		deliberation of the case	605

	19.5.14. Considerations included in the Commission's	
	evaluation	606
	19.5.15. Flat refusal – or approval on certain terms?	607
	19.5.16. The contents of terms and their enforcement	609
	19.5.17. Judicial review of the Commission's decisions	611
	19.5.18. No access to sue for minority shareholders	612
Char	ter 20. Voluntary dissolution: Liquidation	615
20.1.	Liquidation concept and the need for regulation	615
20.1.	Liquidation decision	616
20.2.	Liquidators	618
20.3.	The liquidation procedure	621
20.1.	The inquiration procedure	021
<b>~</b> 1		<b>60</b>
_	ter 21. Mandatory dissolution: Bankruptcy, etc.	627
21.1.	Mandatory dissolution in company law	627
21.2.	Bankruptcy etc.	630
21.3.	International insolvency law	631
21.4.	Reconstruction	634
	21.4.1. Lateral insolvency and company law measures	634
	21.4.2. A Newco holding solution	635
	21.4.3. A Newco-subsidiary solution	636
	21.4.4. A Newco-sister solution	637
	21.4.5. Common requirements in respect of Newco	
	solutions: arms' length terms	639

## Introduction

It will make history when, in the future, the company law of 28 states will be founded on the same basic principles in that the central rules of the EU company law will be binding on not only the old 15 EU states, but also the three EEA states and the 10 new EU Member States to be.

The company law of these many states is not uniform – nor is it required to be so – but all the main company rules will, or shall, be reflected in the company law of each individual state.

Add to this the importance to company law of the basic freedom rights in the EU Treaty, i.e. the right of establishment, the right to provide services, the free movement of labour, etc. These basic rights which derive from primary EU law are very important to the mobility of all companies. Further, the advent of common European company types in the form of the European Economic Interest grouping and – from 8 October 2004 – the European Company – will change the European company law scenario for ever.

In the 'old days' European law accounts of company law necessarily had to be comparative. The accounts would show a lot of features which were common from state to state but basically the emphasis was on the differences in the company law of the states. Now the emphasis will be on the common, cross-border features of company law and this is the main aim of the present account of the EU company law.

The book will focus on the cross-border mobility of companies in the form of access to establish themselves in other states and the requirement of equal treatment of foreign and domestic companies. Secondly, various company types are treated, including the cross-border partnership: the European Economic Interest Grouping, and, from 8 October 2004, the common European company: the SE. Subsequently, the common European tax rules securing the access to cross-border mobility via take-over and merger without releasing of tax, and the access to cross-border group-internal merger of reserves in the form of dividend, likewise without tax release.

Having focused on the EU law enterprise concept in contrast to the company law concept the book goes on to describe the events which will or may occur in a company's lifetime: Its formation, infusion of capital, loss of capital, its issue of securities, the set of rules of the individual company in the form of articles and formation document, the company bodies and shareholders, mutual competence, external and internal relations of board and management, the general meeting, equal treatment of shareholders, including on a majority take-over, employees' rights on transfer of an enterprise from one company to another and on outsourcing of services from company to company, annual report and consolidated accounts, merger, division, merger control liquidation, bankruptcy and reconstruction. All of which is treated from a common European point of view which may seem a bold – but not impossible – venture.

I have endeavoured to ensure that the book does not provide the reader with a barren enumeration of existing and proposed EU provisions but really presents a comprehensive account of the law as it stands. Further the case law of the EC Court, the practice of the European Commission and of the courts of the individual states, especially German courts, is integrated naturally in the account which also goes for the common European legal literature .

Aalborg University, October 2002 www.business.auc.dk

**Erik Werlauff** 

## **Abbreviations**

AktG (German) Aktiengesetz

BGB (German) Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch BGH (German) Bundesgerichtshof

BverfG (German) Bundesverfassungsgericht

CA (Danish) Companies Act

CELEX Data base of legal acts (communitatis europae lex)

CMLRev Common Market Law Review

Código civil (Spanish) civil code

DB Der Betrieb

EBLR European Business Law Review

EC European Community

ECR Compilation of ECJ decisions ECHR European Court of Human Rights

EEA European Economic Area

EEC European Economic Community

EEIG European Economic Interest Grouping

EFTA European Free Trade Area

EHRC European Human Rights Convention

ELR European Law Review

ERT (Swedish) Europarättslig Tidskrift

EU European Taxation
EU European Union

EuZW Europäische Zeitschrift für Wirtschaftsrecht H (Danish) Supreme court judgment or order

J (Danish) Juristen (law periodical)

ICCLJ International and Comparative Corporate Law Journal

L (in OJ context) section L (legislatio)

NJW (German) Neue Juristische Wochenschrift

NTS Nordisk Tidsskrift for Selskabsret (Nordic company

law periodical)

XVII

OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Develop-

ment

OJ Official Journal of the European Communities

OLG (German) Oberlandesgericht PCA (Danish) Private Companies Act

Rabels Zeitschrift für ausländisches und interna-

tionales Privatrecht

R & R (Danish) Revision og Regnskabsvæsen (accountants'

monthly magazine)

SvJT (Swedish) Svensk Juristtidning

TfR (Nordic) Tidsskrift for Rettsvitenskap (original langua-

ge versions of decisions)

TfS (Danish) Tidsskrift for skatter og afgifter (tax and

duties journal)

UfR (Danish) Ugeskrift for Retsvæsen (weekly law reports)
V (Danish) High court decision (V signifies "Western

Division")

ZGR Zeitschrift für Gesellschafts- und Unternehmensrecht

ZIP Zeitschrift für Wirtschaftsrecht

Ø (Danish) High court decision (Ø signifies "Eastern

Division")

#### CHAPTER 1

## Legal Personality And Cross-border Mobility of Companies

### 1.1. Determining the concept of legal person

In the following, legal personality is deemed to exist when property is separated from its owner/s in such manner that it has acquired its own **legal capacity, capacity to make contracts** and accomplish other legal acts ('contractual capacity'), capacity to be a party in legal proceedings in its own right, and 'procedural capacity'. Legal capacity may be defined as the power to hold rights and become liable to duties in one's own name without such right or duty lying with the owners of the property involved. Capacity to make contracts ('contractual capacity') is the power to use one's legal capacity in external dispositions aimed at such purpose. Since the legal person cannot write letters or speak its mind the acts undertaken must necessarily be through the agency of its organs or a certain amount of these. The organs are not the agents, properly speaking, of the legal person since one prerequisite of such agency is that the principal might have elected to perform the acts in question himself. The legal person does not have such choice. It is forced to act through its organs and can only express itself through such channel (or via an agent appointed by one of the organs) in the same way as a person of minority status has to express his mind through his guardian in e.g. contract law matters.

The capacity to be a party is the capacity to sue or be sued in legal proceedings before a court of law or arbitration court. The party in the case is the legal person and not the owners behind it, if any. Likewise, the judgment creditor or debtor is the legal person, not its owner. A judgment against the legal person is not a judgment against its owners. The procedural capacity is the power to dispose of one's party capacity. Thus, procedural capacity.

dural capacity is the procedural equivalent to the capacity to act in civil law, in the same way as capacity to act relates to party capacity, procedural capacity relates to party capacity. Hence, what was said above relating to the organ dispositions on behalf of the legal person is also true in a procedural context.

It is no mandatory requirement for legal personality that the **owners are not liable for its debts**. Although it was established above that such debts lie with the legal person and not with the owners this starting point does not prevent that the legal system a) endows such organisation for which the participants are liable with a legal personality, or conversely, b) allows the owners' liability to be limited to the property without endowing the latter with a legal personality of its own. One example of the a) category is the Regulation on European Economic Interest Groupings which allows each state to determine whether or not the grouping of undertakings is to rank as a legal person, cf. Art 1(3), whereas the requirement of the unlimited, joint and several liability for the grouping's debts is an absolute one, cf. Art 24(1). One example of b) is the Directive on Single-Member private limited liability companies which provides in Art 7 that states which do not recognise single entrepreneurs in company form shall recognise the concept of single member undertakings with limited liability.

## 1.2. A community law definition of legal personality

The 1<sup>st</sup> Company Directive contained provisions on the legal person's external acts and dealt with the issue when a legal person may exceptionally be declared invalid and thereby annulled but it failed, somewhat unaccountably, to define the concept of 'legal person'. Therefore we must address the Regulation on Economic Interest Groupings which deals with a personal company type and not a capital company, to find a definition in Community law of the concept. In Art 1(2) it is established that the grouping of undertakings from the date of registration will acquire the capacity in its own name to have rights and obligations of all kinds (i.e. legal capacity), to make contracts or accomplish other legal acts (i.e. the contractual capacity), and to sue and be sued (i.e. the capacity to be a party in legal proceedings). Combining these statements with Art 20 which provides that only the manager/s may represent the grouping in respect of dealings with third parties we have achieved an adequate

Community law definition of the legal capacity, contractual capacity, the capacity to be a party in legal proceedings, and the procedural capacity which are all inherent in the legal personality concept. That this Community law definition requires priority over an individual state's possibly deviating concepts is evident from Art 2(1) in the Regulation on groupings, which – although leaving the construction of memorandum and articles etc. to the domicil state – excludes from such *renvoi* matters relating to natural persons' 'status and capacity' (legal capacity), and capacity to contract or accomplish other legal acts as well as a legal person's 'status and (contractual) capacity'.

## 1.3. Company nationality determination and -change; international choice of law

The EC Treaty contains no sanction, whether by directive or regulation, for imposing on the Member States a duty to recognise personal or capital companies from the other Member States in a *company law* context (whereas the rules on establishment, which are discussed below, require the Member States to recognise *the freedom of establishment* of commercial legal persons to the same extent as natural person' freedom of establishment). On the other hand the Member States are under a duty to negotiate an agreement on several important issues, including mutual recognition of the companies mentioned in Art 48(2) (formerly Art 58), cf. Art 293, third dash? (formerly Art 220).

On this basis an **agreement on mutual recognition** of companies and legal persons was made as early as 1968. Since that Treaty cannot take force until it has been ratified by all EU states, cf. Art. 14, and since one Member State has declined such ratification it is not yet applicable law in the Member States. Nor is it likely to be.

Hence it *would seem* that the individual state's own private international rules will determine nationality of a company. 'Would seem' is used because this area is also governed by Community law which provides that the nationality determination of a company obtained by such application of private international law must not result in a failure to recognise the legal personality status of lawfully established companies from other EU or EEA countries and thereby provide the means to deny them access to establish themselves, cf. below. This presents a problem especially in