

RUTH NIELSEN

EU Labour Law

DJØF PUBLISHING

EU Labour Law

Denne å[* er omfattet af lov om ophavsret.

Uanset evt. aftale med Copy-Dan er det ikke tilladt at kopiere eller indscanne siden til undervisningsbrug eller erhvervsmæssig brug.

Bogen er udgivet af Djøf Forlag (www.djoef-forlag.dk)

Ruth Nielsen

EU Labour Law



DJØF Publishing
Copenhagen 2013

Denne å[* er omfattet af lov om ophavsret.

Uanset evt. aftale med Copy-Dan er det ikke tilladt at kopiere eller indscanne siden til undervisningsbrug eller erhvervsmæssig brug.

Bogen er udgivet af Djøf Forlag (www.djof-forlag.dk)

Ruth Nielsen
EU Labour Law

2. edition

© 2013 by DJØF Publishing
Jurist- og Økonomforbundets Forlag

All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any
form or by any means – electronic, mechanical,
photocopying, recording or otherwise – without
the prior written permission of the Publisher.

Cover: Bo Helsted
Print: Narayana Press, Gylling
Binding: Jysk Bogbind, Holstebro

Printed in Denmark 2013
ISBN 978-87-574-2566-6

Sold and distributed in Scandinavia by:

DJØF Publishing
Copenhagen, Denmark
Email: forlag@djoef.dk
www.djoef-forlag.dk

Sold and distributed in North America by:
International Specialized Book Services (ISBS)

Portland, USA
Email: orders@isbs.com
www.isbs.com

Sold in all other countries by:
The Oxford Publicity Partnership Ltd
Towcester, UK
Email: djof@oppuk.co.uk
www.oppuk.co.uk

Distributed in all other countries by:
Marston Book Services
Abingdon, Oxon, UK
Email: trade.orders@marston.co.uk
www.marston.co.uk

Denne å[* er omfattet af lov om ophavsret.

Uanset evt. aftale med Copy-Dan er det ikke tilladt at kopiere eller indscanne siden til undervisningsbrug eller erhvervsmæssig brug.

Bogen er udgivet af Djøf Forlag (www.djoef-forlag.dk)

Contents

Preface	25
Chapter One. Introduction	
1 Main purpose of the book	27
1.1. From internal market law to fundamental rights/EMU law	27
1.2 From many separate legal systems to a ‘one big system model’	29
2 Terminology: Labour Law, Welfare Rights and the Constitutionalisation of the European Social Model	31
2.1 Labour Law	31
2.2 Welfare Rights	32
2.3 Constitutionalisation of the European Social Model	33
2.3.1 The two layers of the Economic constitution of the EU	34
2.3.2 The relationship between labour law and the economic constitution of the EU	35
3 Theoretical and methodological approach: Critical legal positivism and legal realism	36
3.1 Legal realism	37
3.2 Critical legal positivism	39
4 European legal Method – Doctrine of the sources of law and their Interpretation	40
5 Delimitations	41
5.1 Not Inter-disciplinary	41
5.2 Not a systematic account of specific National Legal Systems	42
Chapter Two. Sources of EU Labour Law	
1 Introduction	43
2 Phases in the Development	44
2.1 Before the EC/EU	45
2.2 From Rome to Maastricht: the Community before the establishment of the European Union	45
2.2.1 The late 1950’s and the 1960’s	46

Contents

2.2.2	The 1970's: legal activism	46
2.2.3	The 1980's	47
2.3	From Maastricht until today (2013)	50
2.3.1	From Maastricht to Amsterdam. The two tracks: UK and the 11 other EU-countries	51
2.3.2	From Amsterdam to Lisbon	53
2.3.3	The current post-Lisbon period	53
3	Primary EU law	54
3.1	The Treaties	54
3.1.1	General Values and Objectives of the EC/EU	55
3.1.2	Specific Objectives of EU Labour Law	56
3.1.3	The Principle of Conferral	57
3.1.4	Expansion of EU legislative competence in matters of labour law	59
3.1.5	Current legal bases for EU Secondary Legislation in matters of employment and labour	59
3.1.6	Minimum harmonization or full harmonization	62
3.1.7	From Unanimity to Qualified Majority Voting in Council	65
3.2	Fundamental Rights, in particular Fundamental Labour and Employment Rights in the EU	65
3.2.1	The Case Law of the CJEU on Fundamental Rights	66
3.2.2	The 1977 Joint Declaration on Fundamental Rights and the ECHR	70
3.2.3	The Community Charter of the Fundamental Social Rights of Workers 1989	70
3.2.4	Treaty Provisions, in particular Article 6 TEU and Article 151 TFEU	71
3.2.5	The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union (CFREU) 2000/2007	72
3.2.6	Changes in the Legal Basis of Fundamental Rights after the Lisbon Treaty	73
3.2.7	Substantive Content of the CFREU	74
3.2.8	Legal Effect of Fundamental Rights internally in EU law	75
3.2.9	Legal Effect in National Law of CFREU and other Fundamental Rights and General Principles of EU Law	75
3.2.10	Free Movement and Fundamental Rights. The double justification test	82

3.2.11	Competing Fundamental Rights	84
3.3.	General Principles	84
3.3.1	General principle of equal treatment in labour law ..	84
3.3.2	Consultation	85
4	Secondary EU Law	85
4.1	Directives	85
4.2	Social partners and Collective Agreements at EU level	85
4.3	Recommendations	87
5	Case law	87
6	Soft law	89
6.1	The Community Charter of the Fundamental Social Rights of Workers 1989	89
6.2	Social Action programmes	89
6.3	The Open Method of Coordination (OMC)	90
6.4	The Lisbon Strategy	90
6.5	The Europe 2020 Strategy	91
6.6	The European Semester	92
7	Scholarly Legal writing	93
8	Public international law	94
8.1	International doctrine of sources of law	94
8.2	WTO	95
8.3	ILO (International Labour Organisation)	96
8.3.1	Tripartite structure	96
8.3.2	Constitution: Labour is not a Commodity	96
8.3.3	Conventions and recommendations	97
8.3.4	Fundamental rights	97
8.3.5	Reference to ILO law in EU labour law	97
8.4	Council of Europe Conventions	98
8.4.1	1ECHR (European Convention on Human Rights 1950)	98
8.4.2	Council of Europe Social Charter 1961, amended by the Council of Europe Revised Social Charter 1996	100
8.5	Customary international law: Labour is not a Commodity	102
8.6	International soft law	103
9	National Law	104
9.1	National Law as a Source of EU Labour Law	104
9.2	EU requirements to national law	104
9.2.1	Horisontal Direct Effect	104

Contents

9.2.2	Duty to interpret national law in conformity with EU law	106
9.2.3	Reference to ECHR as a Source of law	107
9.2.4	Generalisation of labour law in the field of Equality and Non- discrimination	107
9.2.5	Double aim – both economic and social	108
9.2.6	Minimum Harmonization	108
9.2.7	Enforcement	108
9.3	Changes in National Doctrines of the Sources of Law: Diminishing Role of Collective Agreements and Preparatory Works	109
9.3.1	Collective agreements	109
9.3.2	Preparatory Works	110
10	The relationship between International labour law, EU labour law and national labour law	110
10.1	National law and international law: The monist and dualist approach in national law	111
10.2	Pre-EC/EU international law obligations which are inconsistent with EU law	113

Chapter Three. Collective Labour Law: The Right to Organise, Collective Bargaining and Industrial Action

1	Introduction	115
2	Sources of Law	115
2.1	National law	115
2.2	Public International Law	116
2.2.1	ILO Law	116
2.2.2	Council of Europe Conventions	117
2.3	EU law	118
2.3.1	The Community Charter of the Fundamental Social Rights of Workers 1989	119
2.3.2	Guidelines for the economic policies in th EMU	121
2.3.3	CFREU	121
2.3.4	Free movement of workers	123
2.3.5	Case law	123
3	Positive right of Association	124
3.1	Rutili	125
3.2	Vogt	125
3.3	Moser	126
3.4	Wilson	127

4	The Negative Freedom to organise. Closed Shop Agreements	129
4.1	British Rail	129
4.2	Sibson	130
4.3	Sigurjónsson	131
4.4	Gustafsson	132
4.5	Sørensen and Ramussen	133
5	Collective bargaining	136
5.1	General Characteristic	136
5.2	Main Differences at National Level	137
5.3	Parties to a Collective Agreement	138
5.3.1	On the Employer Side	138
5.3.2	Capacity of Trade Unions to Conclude Collective Agreements	139
5.4	Obligatory and Normative Effect of Collective Agreements ..	140
5.5	Obligatory (or Contractual) Effect	141
5.6	The Normative Effect of Collective Agreements	142
5.6.1	Mandatory Normative Effect	142
5.6.2	Residual Normative Effect	142
5.7	Personal Scope of the Mandatory Effect	143
5.7.1	Which Employers are Bound? Erga Omnes Effect ..	143
5.7.2	Towards which Employees is the Employer Bound	144
5.8	Negotiating Competence and Obligations	144
5.9	Collective Agreements and Competition Law	146
5.10	Collective Agreements in the Hierarchy of the Sources of Law	147
5.11	Semi-Mandatory Statutory Legislation	148
6	Collective Agreements at European Level	149
6.1	Enterprise level cross-border collective agreements	149
6.2	EU wide collective agreements	149
6.2.1	Framework agreements as first steps to directives ..	150
6.2.2	Autonomous framework agreements	150
6.3	The UEAPME Case	151
6.3.1	Right or Duty to Negotiate	152
6.3.2	Representativity	153
6.3.3	The Principle of Democracy	154
6.4	Use of collective agreements as means to transpose directives into national law	154
7	Industrial action	160
7.1	Sources of law	160
7.1.1	ILO Conventions	160

Contents

7.1.2	Council of Europe Conventions	161
7.1.3	EU law	163
7.2	Conflicts of Interest and Conflicts of Right	163
7.3	Peace Obligation	164
7.4	The Right to Strike as a Fundamental Right. Monti I Regulation	164
8	Interplay between national collective labour law and free movement	165
8.1	Viking	166
8.2	Laval	167
8.2.1	Laval in its historical context – the Law before Lisbon	167
8.2.2	Facts of the Laval case	168
8.2.3	The progress of the Laval case	169
8.2.4	The industrial action: Blockade and sympathetic action	170
8.2.5	Legal Problem	171
8.2.5.1	Is collective action covered by EU law or a purely national issue?	171
8.2.5.2	Transparency	171
8.2.5.3	Legitimate goal	171
8.2.5.4	EU competence	172
8.2.5.5	Discrimination	172
8.2.5.6	Free movement in a private law context. Direct, horizontal effect	173
8.2.6	Debate about Laval	173
8.2.6.1	Relevance of ILO law	174
8.2.6.2	Ignorance of collective labour law	175
8.2.6.3	Linguistic carelessness	175
8.2.7	The withdrawn Proposal for a Monti II Regulation	176
8.3	Rüffert	177
8.4	Commission v Luxembourg	180
8.5	Commission v Germany	180

Chapter Four. Information, Consultation and Participation

1	Introduction	181
2	Sources of Law	182
2.1	Public international law and national law	182
2.2	EU Law	183
2.2.1	General	183

2.2.2	EU-rules on Information and consultation at national level	184
2.2.3	Information, consultation and participation at transnational level	185
2.2.4	Traditional directives, no framework agreements between the social partners	186
3	General Framework on Information and Consultation at national level	186
3.1	Background to the directive	187
3.2	The Preamble to the directive	188
3.3	Object and principles	188
3.4	Definitions	189
3.4.1	Undertaking	189
3.4.2	Establishment	189
3.4.3	Employer	189
3.4.4	Employee	189
3.4.5	Employees' representatives	189
3.4.6	Information and consultation	189
3.5	Scope	190
3.6	Practical arrangements for information and consultation	192
3.7	Agreement	192
3.8	Confidential information	193
3.9	Protection of employees' representatives	194
3.10	Relation to other information and consultation provisions	195
4	European Work's Councils	196
4.1	Background	196
4.2	Objective	199
4.3	Definitions	200
4.3.1	European Works Council (EWC)	200
4.3.2	Controlling Undertaking	200
4.3.3	Information	200
4.3.4	Consultation	201
4.4	Responsibility for the establishment of a European Works Council	202
4.4.1	Initiative	202
4.4.2	Groups of companies	202
4.5	Special Negotiating Body	204
4.6	Agreement	205
4.7	Subsidiary Requirements	206
4.8	Confidential information	208

Contents

4.9	Spirit of cooperation	210
4.10	Role and capacity of employee representatives	210
4.10.1	Resources	210
4.10.2	Training	210
4.10.3	Spread of information	210
4.10.4	Protection	210
4.10.5	Balanced representation	211
4.11	Transnational competence of EWC	211
4.12	Links with national bodies	211
4.13	Adaptation Clause	212
5	Employee information, consultation and participation in a European company (SE)	212
5.1.	Establishment of SE's	212
5.2	Employee involvement in SE Companies	213
5.3	Aim of the Directive on employee involvement	213
5.4	The 'before and after' principle	214
5.5	Definitions	214
5.5.1	SE	215
5.5.2	Participating companies	215
5.5.3	Subsidiary	215
5.5.4	Concerned subsidiary or establishment	215
5.5.5	Employees' representatives	215
5.5.6	Representative body	215
5.5.7	Special negotiating body	215
5.5.8	Involvement of employees	216
5.5.9	Information	216
5.5.10	Consultation	216
5.5.11	Participation	216
5.6	Special Negotiation Body	216
5.7	Agreement	219
5.8	Duration of negotiations	220
5.9	Standard rules	220
5.10	Confidential information	224
6	European Cooperative Society (SCE)	224
6.1	Priority to negotiation and alternative route for some 'ex novo' SCEs	226
6.2	Transnational negotiation procedure	226
6.3	Autonomy of the parties as to the content of the agreement ...	228
6.4	Standard rules to be applied in the absence of an agreement ..	228

7	Cross-border mergers	230
7.1	Only rules on worker participation	231
8	The European Economic Interest Grouping (EEIG)	234
Chapter Five. Free Movement of Workers and Union Citizens		
1	Introduction	235
2	The sources of law	236
3	Migrant workers within the EU	242
3.1	The Concept of Worker in regard to Article 45 TFEU	242
3.1.1	Job seekers	246
3.1.2	A-typical Workers	247
3.1.3	Social Clients	248
3.1.4	Family Members of Migrant Workers	249
3.2	The Right to Move to and Reside in another EU-country	250
3.2.1	Article 45(3) TFEU	250
3.3	The Ban on Discrimination on Grounds of Nationality	251
3.3.1	Direct Discrimination	252
3.3.2	Indirect Discrimination	253
3.3.3	Reverse Discrimination	255
3.3.4	Social and tax advantages	258
3.3.5	First time job-seekers	259
3.3.6	Vocational training and education	262
3.4	The public sector	265
3.5	Restrictions to the Free Movement of Workers	267
3.6	Ordre public (public policy, public security and public health)	269
3.6.1	Secondary Legislation	269
3.6.2	The Ordre Public Provisions in the Free Movement and Residence Directive	272
3.6.3	Justification of restrictions	273
3.6.4	Overriding Reasons of General Interest	273
3.6.5	The principle of transparency	274
3.7	Migrant workers and fundamental rights	275
4	EU Citizenship	276
4.1	Sources of law	278
4.2	The Right to Entry and Residence in other EU Countries	280
4.2.1	The initial period, 3-6 months	280
4.2.2	The intermediate period	280
4.2.3	Permanent residence after 5 years	281
4.3	Equal Treatment	282

Contents

4.4	Social security rights of union citizens	282
5	Third country nationals	283
5.1	Discrimination on grounds of nationality with regard to third country nationals	284
5.2	Agreements between EU and Third Countries	286
5.2.1	Iceland, Liechtenstein and Norway	286
5.2.2	Switzerland	286
5.2.3	Turkey	286
5.2.4	Countries with no agreement	287
5.3	Council of Europe Convention no 93 on the legal Status of Migrant Workers	288
5.4	Long-term Residents	288
5.4.1	Conditions for Acquiring Status as Long-term Residents	288
5.4.2	Exclusion of A-typical Workers	289
5.4.3	Equal Treatment	289
5.5	Illegal immigration	290

Chapter Six. Equality and Non-Discrimination

1	Introduction	291
2	Sources of Law	292
2.1	Public International Law	292
2.1.1	ILO	292
2.1.2	Council of Europe Conventions	293
2.1.3	United Nation Conventions	295
2.2	EU Law from Rome to Amsterdam	300
2.3	After the adoption of the Amsterdam Treaty	303
2.3.1	Gender Equality	304
2.3.2	Ethnic discrimination	305
2.3.3	Framework for equal treatment in employment and occupation regardless of religion or belief, age, disability and sexual orientation	307
2.3.4	CFREU	308
3	Basic discrimination concepts	309
3.1	Direct Discrimination	310
3.2	Indirect Discrimination	311
3.3	Harassment and Sexual Harassment	314
3.4	Instruction to Discriminate	314

4	Gender Equality	315
4.1	The concept of worker and pregnant worker in regard to gender equality	315
4.2	Equal Pay	315
4.2.1	The definition of pay	317
4.2.2	Pay, pensions and social security	317
4.2.3	Job classification systems	319
4.2.4	Education and vocational training	321
4.2.5	Seniority/Experience	321
4.2.6	Part time discrimination as indirect sex discrimination	322
4.2.7	Part time and overtime payment	323
4.3	Equal treatment as regards access to employment, vocational training and promotion and working conditions	324
4.3.1	Prohibition of discrimination	324
4.3.2	Return from maternity leave	325
4.3.3	Different Dismissal ages for men and women	325
4.4	Pregnancy and maternity/paternity related issues	325
4.4.1	Discrimination in the access to employment – recruitment process and monitoring	326
4.4.2	The remuneration of pregnant workers and workers on maternity leave	328
4.4.3	Dismissals during maternity and parental leave	329
4.4.4	Effective judicial protection	330
4.4.5	The Parental Leave Directive	331
4.4.6	Fixed-term contracts	333
4.4.7	Breastfeeding etc.	333
4.5	Mainstreaming	333
5	Discrimination on Grounds of Religion or Belief	334
6	Discrimination on Grounds of Age	336
6.1	Permissible Differences under Article 6 of Directive 2000/78	337
6.2	Retirement Ages	337
6.3	Other Questions	343
7	Discrimination on Grounds of Disability	345
7.1	Concept of disability	346
7.2	Employer's duty to Reasonable accommodation for disabled persons	347
8	Discrimination on Grounds of Sexual Orientation	348

Contents

9	General ban on discrimination in Employment and Occupation	349
9.1	General principle of equal application of EU law. Article 20 CFREU	349
9.2	Article 21 CFREU	350
10	Exceptions from the Ban on Discrimination	351
10.1	Maternity Protection	351
10.2	Paternity and adoption leave	351
10.3	Positive Action	351
10.4	Genuine Occupational Qualifications	352
11	Enforcement and Monitoring	353
11.1	Minimum Requirements	353
11.2	Defence of Rights	354
11.3	Burden of Proof	355
11.4	Victimisation	357
11.5	Dissemination of information	358
11.6	Social and Civil dialogue	358
11.7	Bodies for the promotion of equal treatment	360
11.8	Compensation or reparation	361
11.9	Sanctions/penalties	362

Chapter Seven. Employment Contracts and Employment Relationships

1	Introduction	365
2	Sources of law	365
2.1	National law	365
2.2	Public International law	366
2.3	EU law	366
2.3.1	Directives	366
2.3.2	Fundamental rights	366
3	Choice of Law and international jurisdiction	367
3.1	The Rome I Regulation	367
3.2	The Rome Convention	369
4	Posting of workers in the framework of the provision of services	369
4.1	Scope	369
4.2	Aim and legal basis of the posting of workers directive	370
4.3	Posting of workers and choice of law	371
4.4	Main Content of the Directive	372
4.5	Statutory minimum standards	373
4.6	Topics within the core area of Article 3(1) of the Posting of Workers Directive	374

4.7	Minimum Wages	374
4.8	Universally Applicable Collective Agreements	375
4.9	Outside of the Core Area. Public Policy (Ordre Public)	378
4.10	Posting of Workers and collective action	380
4.11	ILO Convention 94 on Labour Clauses in Public Contracts ...	381
	Information requirements	383
5	Employer's Obligation to inform employees of applicable working conditions	384
5.1	Background	384
5.2	Aim	384
5.3	Scope	384
5.4	Obligation to provide information	385
5.5	Means of information	387
5.6	Expatriate employees	387
5.7	Minimum directive	388
5.8	Defence of Rights	388
6	Part Time Work	389
6.1	Background	389
6.2	Scope	389
6.3	Definitions	392
6.3.1	Part time worker	392
6.3.2	Comparable full-time worker	392
6.4	The principle of non-discrimination	393
6.4.1	Prohibition against unjustified discrimination solely on grounds of part time	393
6.4.2	Pro rata temporis	395
6.4.3	Justification	396
6.5	Opportunities for part-time work	396
6.5.1	Duties of Member States and Social Partners	396
6.5.2	Employers' duties	397
7	Fixed Term contracts	397
7.1	Background	397
7.1.1	The framework agreement on fixed-term work	397
7.2	Purpose	398
7.3	Scope	399
7.4	Definitions	399
7.4.1	Fixed term worker	400
7.4.2	Comparable permanent worker	400
7.5	Non-discrimination	400
7.6	Measures to prevent abuse	403