

UNIVERSITY OF COPENHAGEN
FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES



Beyond intractability?

Territorial solutions to self-determination conflicts

PhD Dissertation 2020
Livia Rohrbach

DEPARTMENT OF POLITICAL SCIENCE
FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
UNIVERSITY OF COPENHAGEN
PHD DISSERTATION 2020 · ISBN 978-87-7209-351-2

LIVIA ROHRBACH

Beyond intractability?

Territorial solutions to self-determination conflicts

Beyond intractability?

Territorial solutions to self-determination conflicts

Livia Rohrbach

University of Copenhagen
Faculty of Social Sciences
Department of Political Science

This dissertation is presented for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

February 2020

Beyond intractability? Territorial solutions to self-determination conflicts

Supervisor

Professor Peter Thisted Dinesen, University of Copenhagen

Co-supervisor

Professor Daniel Bochsler, Central European University

PhD Dissertation 2020 © Livia Rohrbach

ISBN 978-87-7209-351-2 (Printed book)

ISBN 978-87-7209-359-8 (E-book)

Printed by SL grafik, Frederiksberg, Denmark (slgrafik.dk)

Preface & Acknowledgements

This is an article-based dissertation project which culminates from my three and a half years enrolment in the PhD Program at the Department of Political Science, Copenhagen University. I seek to answer the following overarching research question:

Why are territorial self-governance arrangements successful in some cases but not others?

The dissertation is article-based, meaning it includes five self-contained articles, all of which present a unique argument and can be read without the initial chapters on theoretical and empirical approaches to the overall study of self-determination disputes. The initial chapters ('project frame') are intended to foster a better understanding of how the articles relate to each other and how they – cumulatively – speak to the overall question of why autonomy 'works' in some cases but not in others. The project frame also draws some broader theoretical perspectives, summarises the findings presented in the dissertation, and highlights the main implications for both academics and practitioners.

The articles address the overall question from several different vantage points and with distinct but complementary empirical strategies. At the very heart of the project is a new dataset on formal and informal territorial self-governance arrangements in democratic and non-democratic countries, and data collected during field research in Ethiopia. The following five articles are located in Chapter 5 through 9:

1. *Shifting patterns of tactics and strategies: Bargaining over self-determination in Indonesia*
2. *Institutional patterns of autonomy arrangements: Introducing the TSG dataset (TSG), 1950 – 2016*
3. *Autonomous by design: Territorial self-governance and violent conflict*
4. *Say my name: The effect of titular vs. non-titular status on communal violence in ethnofederations*
5. *Intra-party dynamics and the success of federal arrangements: Ethiopia in comparative perspective*

‘It takes two to tango’ – in this case it took ‘many’. This dissertation project would not have been accomplished without the support of countless people along the way, who all left their personal mark upon it. I have grown not only professionally, but also personally in this rewarding process. I am grateful for all the amazing opportunities that have presented themselves, all the incredibly smart, devoted and kind people I have met - some of whom I now call good friends - and all the life changing experiences throughout this journey. And oh boy – what a journey it was!

A dissertation is never entirely ‘done’ - there is always room for improvement and endless inspiration to pursue further avenues, often resulting in a feeling of seemingly moving further away from, rather than closer to, completing. My very special gratitude in this regard goes to my partner Chris, who was solid as a rock in the tidal flows of self-reassurance and doubt, triumph and defeat. I am also grateful to my friends and family, who always managed to take my thoughts off ‘that thing you study’ when needed.

None of this would have been possible without the tireless support of my former-main-current-co supervisor Daniel Bochsler, who always devoted time and effort that benefited the progression of this project greatly. I would also like to thank Peter Thisted Dinesen, who stepped in as main supervisor when Daniel had gone east to take on new challenges. Thank you both for providing guidance when needed, but also for challenging me in a way that ultimately improved this dissertation project immensely. I would also like to thank the student assistants – Michelle and Sophie, without your help I would still be coding formal and informal territorial self-governance arrangements. I would also like to thank the POSH-team for great collaborative work along the way, in particular Andreas!

It will not be possible to mention everyone who deserves mentioning – it is simply too many. I will nevertheless make an attempt. I would like to thank my amazing colleagues at the Department, especially my fellow colleagues and friends in the PhD group. The support I have received from you as a group, in particular the endless discussions and encouragement, have shaped this project and also my very personal experience in Copenhagen greatly. A few personal mentions: Wiebke, thank you for always supporting me with words, tea, and pastries; Anne, thank you for being my partner in the last few months of the process, you have been so supportive!; Dean, thank you for being you – you are the best; work-Chris, thank you for all the breaks, great discussions, and feedback; Ben & Anders, thanks for always engaging with my research and making me feel at home; Christian Rostbøll for his commitment and support as Head of PhD programme and Lene Holm Pedersen as his successor.

A very special thanks also goes to my extended family in Aarhus, who always invited and included me, in particular Matilde, Alex, Vilde, Sutan, Svend-Erik, Lasse and Henrikas for excellent feedback at my 'Slutseminar'.

The time I have spent at IBEI in Barcelona further left a great impact on me. Thank you for being my mentor during and beyond that time, Lesley-Ann, and thank you for including me in the research environment, Mathias. Abel, thank you for introducing me to the Catalan way of life – I greatly enjoyed it!

A substantial part of this dissertation is built on field research in Ethiopia – which would never have been possible with the support of so many kind souls. First, I would like to thank the interviewees for their insightful comments. I would also like to thank Jan Erk, who shared some good advice and contacts with me, Seyoum for welcoming me and being my support on the ground, Zemelak for great conversations and exchanges back then and now, Lulit for being my guide in Hawassa and who became a friend along the way, and Debebe for being extremely helpful and putting me in touch with so many people. Also thanks to Jonathan in Uganda who has introduced me to the kingdom of Buganda in its present and past!

I gratefully acknowledge funding for this project by the Swiss National Science Foundation (SNF) under Grant Number 166228.

Contents (concise)

Project frame

1	Introduction	1
2	Accommodation of diversity in multiethnic states	9
3	How to study self-determination disputes	26
4	Review of the past and outlook into the future.....	34

	Summary (English)	41
--	--------------------------------	----

	Resumé (Danish summary)	43
--	--------------------------------------	----

	Research articles	45
--	--------------------------------	----

5	Shifting patterns of tactics and strategies	46
---	---	----

6	Institutional patterns of autonomy arrangements	66
---	---	----

7	Autonomous by design	90
---	----------------------------	----

8	Say my name	109
---	-------------------	-----

9	Intra-party dynamics and the success of federal arrangements	133
---	--	-----

	References	153
--	-------------------------	-----

	Supplementary material	166
--	-------------------------------------	-----

Contents (detailed)

Project frame

1 Introduction	1
Successful in some cases, but not in others? Research questions.....	3
Territorial solutions to self-determination disputes: The dissertation project	5
2 Accommodation of diversity in multiethnic states: A review	9
Ethnicity, territory and territorial self-governance: Concepts	9
Ethnicity and territory.....	9
Territorial self-governance as a concept.....	10
Self-determination disputes: The three different phases	12
Why do groups demand self-governance? Phase 1	13
Why do governments accommodate some groups but not others? Phase 2	14
Why are TSGAs successful in some cases but not in others? Phase 3	17
3 How to study self-determination disputes: Empirical approaches	26
Methodological challenges	26
Limitations of existing approaches.....	28
The dissertation's multi-methods approach.....	29
Quantitative analysis.....	29
Field research in Ethiopia	30
Comparative analysis of secessionist movements in Indonesia.....	33
4 Review of the past and outlook into the future: Findings, contributions and implications	34
Main findings and contributions.....	34
International determinants are crucial for self-determination disputes	34
Accounting for variation in subnational autonomy spurs innovation.....	34
Autonomy needs to be balanced.....	35
Ethnic autonomy has consequences for local communal violence.....	35
Extra-constitutional factors condition the success of TSGAs	36
Answer(s) to the research question(s)	36
Implications, or: What are the alternatives?	38
Summary (English)	41
Resumé (Danish summary)	43

Research articles

5 Shifting patterns of tactics and strategies: Bargaining over self-determination in Indonesia	46
Introduction	47
Self-determination disputes – Who gets what, when and how?	48
The strategic playing field and the role of the international community.....	49
Subnational comparison – An illustrative empirical example.....	50
Self-determination disputes between the Indonesian government and groups in East Timor, Aceh and West Papua	51
East Timor	51
Aceh.....	55
West Papua	59
Conclusion.....	63
6 Institutional patterns of autonomy arrangements: Introducing the Territorial Self-Governance Dataset (TSG), 1950-2016	66
Introduction	67
The TSG dataset within the universe of related datasets.....	69
The universe of related datasets.....	69
What is still missing?.....	66
The TSG dataset and its use	68
Conceptualization, operationalization and measurement	69
A typology of territorial self-governance arrangements.....	69
Conceptualizing and measuring the degree and scope of autonomy	73
Self-rule	75
Shared-rule	75
Applying the rules: Coding global incidence of TSGAs	76
Challenges	78
Exploring patterns in the TSG dataset.....	80
Global and temporal patterns.....	80
Regional self- and shared-rule patterns	85
Conclusion.....	88
7 Autonomous by design: Territorial self-governance and violent conflict	90
Introduction	91
A review of the autonomy-conflict nexus	93
Balancing self-rule and shared-rule.....	95
Data and measurement	98
Measuring territorial self-governance: the TSG dataset.....	98

Dependent variable and controls	100
Analysis	101
Conclusion: Finding the right balance.....	107

8 Say my name: The effect of titular vs. non-titular status on local communal violence in ethnofederations 109

Introduction	110
Communal violence and ethnic autonomy	112
Previous research on communal violence	112
Localized grievances and the politicization of ethnicity in ethnofederal systems.....	113
Elite incentives for mobilization.....	115
Linking ethnic autonomy and communal violence.....	115
Analysis: Local conflict dynamics in Ethiopia.....	118
Background and case selection.....	118
Data	121
Quantitative analysis	123
Qualitative analysis and illustration of mechanisms	128
Discussion of preliminary results	130
Conclusion.....	131

9 Intra-party dynamics and the success of federal arrangements: Ethiopia in comparative perspective..... 133

Introduction	134
Conditions of ‘success’ and ‘failure’ in federal arrangements	135
The formal design question	136
Extra-constitutional factors.....	136
The political context.....	137
Research design.....	138
Empirical illustration: the Ethiopian federal system	140
Background.....	140
The TPLF.....	142
The Ethiopian federal arrangement under one-party dominance.....	142
Leadership selection and access to political power	142
Representation and consultation.....	144
Rules underlying decision-making	146
Implications for the success of federal arrangements: Ethiopia in comparative perspective	146
The unsettled transition	148
Conclusion.....	150